

Implementation of Street Vendor Arrangement Policy in The Red Zone of Alun-Alun and Grand Mosque Area in Bandung City

Sri Masrifah¹

Program Magister Ilmu Pemerintahan, Pasca Sarjana, Universitas Langlangbuana

Pandji Santosa²

Program Magister Ilmu Pemerintahan, Pasca Sarjana, Universitas Langlangbuana

Slamet Suwanto³

Program Magister Ilmu Pemerintahan, Pasca Sarjana, Universitas Langlangbuana

Correspondence : Sri Masrifah (srimasrifah75@gmail.com)

Submitted : 16-01-2025, Accepted : 16-02-2025, Published : 16-03-2025

Abstract

The implementation of the street vendor (PKL) management policy in the red zone of the Alun-Alun and Grand Mosque area in Bandung City presents a significant challenge for the Bandung City Government. While street vendors contribute significantly to the local economy, they also disrupt urban order and aesthetics. This study aims to analyze the implementation of the street vendor management policy, identify the challenges encountered, and formulate strategies to enhance its effectiveness. This research employs a qualitative approach, utilizing data collection techniques such as in-depth interviews, observations, and document analysis. The findings indicate that key factors influencing policy implementation include communication among policy actors, resource availability, vendor compliance, and socio-economic resistance. The primary obstacles to policy implementation consist of inadequate socialization of the policy to street vendors, limited relocation space, and weak enforcement by relevant authorities. To overcome these challenges, the government needs to improve communication with street vendors, provide strategically located relocation areas, and strengthen collaboration with various stakeholders. With a more participatory approach and comprehensive solutions, the management policy for street vendors in strategic urban areas can be more effective in creating an orderly, comfortable, and sustainable city environment.

Keywords: Policy Implementation, Street Vendors, Urban Management, Red Zone, Bandung City

Introduction

As a metropolitan city, Bandung faces significant challenges in managing public spaces, one of which is the presence of street vendors (PKL). Although they play an important role in the local economy, street vendors operating in red zones such as the Alun-Alun area and the Grand Mosque of Bandung often cause issues related to order, traffic congestion, and

cleanliness. Therefore, the Bandung City Government has implemented a street vendor management policy to create a more orderly and aesthetically pleasing environment.

Literature Review

Public Policy Theory

Public policy is a series of decisions and actions taken by the government to address societal issues. The policymaking process includes problem identification, formulation of alternatives, decision-making, implementation, and policy evaluation. In the context of street vendors (PKL), policies aim to create a balance between informal economic activities and public space order.

Policy Implementation

Policy implementation is the process of translating established policies into concrete actions. The success of implementation is influenced by factors such as policy clarity, inter-agency coordination, resources, and community involvement. Various policy implementation models include:

- a) Top-Down Model, which emphasizes control from the central government to field implementers.
- b) Bottom-Up Model, which highlights the role of policy implementers and the community.
- c) Interactive Model, which combines top-down and bottom-up approaches to create more flexible policies.
- d) Institutional Model, which examines how bureaucratic structures affect policy implementation.
- e) Synergistic Model, which emphasizes collaboration between the government, society, and the private sector.

Challenges in Implementing Street Vendor Management Policies

The implementation of street vendor management policies in Bandung City faces several key

challenges, including:

- a) Resistance from vendors, as the policy is perceived to disrupt their livelihoods.
- b) Lack of inter-agency coordination, which hinders effective policy execution.
- c) Mismatch between policy and field conditions, such as insufficient infrastructure for relocated vendors.
- d) Unclear regulations, which can lead to confusion in policy implementation.

Supporting and Inhibiting Factors

Supporting factors in policy implementation include government support, adequate infrastructure, effective socialization, and the involvement of the community and vendors. On the other hand, inhibiting factors include vendor resistance, limited government resources, and inconsistent policy changes.

Case Study : Street Vendor Management Polici in Bandung City

The Bandung City Government has implemented various strategies for managing street vendors, such as providing designated spaces, offering training and development programs, and enforcing strict supervision. Despite challenges in implementation, these policies have brought benefits, including improved public space order and more stable economic conditions for vendors.

Mehods

This study employs a qualitative approach with a descriptive-analytical method. Data is collected through interviews with relevant stakeholders, field observations, and analysis of policy documents. The objective of this research is to understand the effectiveness of the street vendor management policy, identify the obstacles faced, and formulate strategic solutions to enhance its implementation.

Results and Discussion

Implementation of the Street Vendor Management Policy

The Bandung City Government has adopted various strategies to manage street vendors, including:

- a) Socialization and Communication: Informing vendors about regulations and restrictions on selling in red zones.
- b) Relocation: Providing alternative trading spaces in more organized areas, such as official markets or designated green zones for vendors.
- c) Law Enforcement: Imposing sanctions on vendors who violate the rules through enforcement operations by the municipal police (Satpol PP).
- d) Empowerment of Street Vendors: Training programs and financial assistance to help vendors transition to a more organized trade system.

2. Challenges in Policy Implementation

Several key obstacles in implementing this policy include:

- a) Lack of Socialization: Many vendors do not fully understand the reasons behind the policy.
- b) Resistance from Vendors: Many street vendors refuse to relocate as the new locations are perceived as less strategic and less profitable.
- c) Limited Relocation Space: The government struggles to provide adequate alternative trading locations.
- d) Weak Supervision: Many vendors return to their original locations after enforcement operations.

3. Efforts to Overcome Challenges

To improve the effectiveness of the street vendor management policy, several strategic

measures can be taken, such as:

- a) Enhanced Communication: The government should strengthen socialization efforts with a more persuasive and dialogical approach.
- b) Collaboration with the Private Sector: Partnering with private entities to provide better and more strategic relocation spaces.
- c) Incentives for Vendors: Offering financial assistance or affordable rent for vendors willing to relocate.
- d) Stronger Monitoring and Evaluation: Regular supervision and stricter sanctions for vendors who violate the rules.

Impact of Policy Implementation

a) Social Impact

The management of street vendors in red zones has helped create a more comfortable public space for the community. However, on the other hand, this policy has also triggered social tensions between vendors and government officials due to enforcement actions perceived as unfair.

b) Economic Impact

Relocating street vendors to more organized locations can improve their competitiveness and income in the long run. However, in the short term, many vendors experience a decline in income due to losing their regular customers.

c) Environmental Impact

The management of street vendors has positively impacted city cleanliness and aesthetics. Public spaces that were previously disorderly due to unregulated street vending are now cleaner and more comfortable for pedestrians and tourists.

Conclusion

The implementation of the street vendor management policy in Bandung City's red zones

is an essential step toward creating a more orderly and comfortable urban environment. However, this policy still faces various challenges, particularly vendor resistance and limited relocation space. Therefore, a more participatory and strategic approach is needed to ensure the policy is effective and accepted by all stakeholders.

Recommendations to enhance the effectiveness of this policy include:

- a) Human-Centered Approach in Socialization: Involving street vendors in policy planning to ensure they feel included in decision-making.
- b) Improvement of Relocation Facilities: Providing better amenities at relocation sites to help vendors attract customers.
- c) Multi-Stakeholder Collaboration: Engaging various parties, including private companies and community groups, to support this policy.

Regular Monitoring and Evaluation: Ensuring the policy is implemented as planned through routine evaluations.

References

Journal:

- Halim, A., & Sembiring, I. (2015). Urban management and public policy: *A case study of street vendors in urban Indonesia*. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 37(2), 182-194.
- Iskandar, M., & Pratama, D. (2020). Analisis Pencemaran Sungai Cikapundung di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Lingkungan Indonesia*, 12(2), 45-57.
- Nugroho, B., & Yuwono, A. (2022). *Urban spatial planning and challenges in managing informal sectors in Indonesia*. *Urban Studies Journal*, 45(3), 12–28.
- Nugroho, Y., & Yuwono, E. (2022). Kebijakan Penataan PKL dan Pengelolaan Ruang Kota di Indonesia. *Jurnal Perencanaan Kota*, 14(2), 112-125.
- Pratama, I. B., & Fitria, E. (2020). *The role of local government in the management of street vendors: A case study in Indonesia*. *Journal of Public Administration*, 44(3), 254-268.

- Rachman, D. (2021). Konflik dan Negosiasi dalam Penertiban PKL di Perkotaan. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial*, 19(1), 87-101.
- Rahmawati, F., Pratama, S., & Surya, D. (2023). Tantangan Tata Ruang Perkotaan di Kota Besar: Studi Kasus Bandung. *Jurnal Perencanaan Wilayah dan Kota*, 18(3), 143-158.
- Rukmana, D. (2012). *Urban informal economy: Street vendors and their role in the economy*. Indonesian Journal of Urban Studies, 29(1), 75-88.
- Setiawan, A. (2021). Relokasi PKL di Kota Bandung: Studi Kasus Teras Cihampelas. *Jurnal Tata Kota*, 15(2), 56-70.
- Singh, M., et al. (2021). *Managing street vendors in urban areas: International practices and implications for developing countries*. Journal of Urban Affairs, 43(5), 1020–1040.
- Singh, R., Kumar, M., & Sharma, A. (2021). *Urban Planning and Informal Sector Management: A Global Perspective*. Urban Studies Review, 39(1), 45-63.
- Sutrisno, A., & Wahyuni, S. (2023). Evaluasi Kebijakan Penataan PKL di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Studi Perkotaan*, 22(1), 31-44.
- Utami, S. M., Hadi, P., & Andriani, M. (2023). Analisis Kebijakan Penataan PKL di Kota Bandung: Masalah dan Solusi. *Jurnal Manajemen Kota*, 15(2), 98-112.
- Utami, W., et al. (2023). *Street vending in Indonesia: Challenges and policy interventions*. Southeast Asian Urban Review, 11(2), 34–47.
- Widyastuti, T. (2018). *Urban governance and the street vendors: Policy and practice in Indonesia*. Jurnal Administrasi Publik, 20(1), 44-56.
- Yulianto, H. (2021). Ekonomi Informal di Kota Besar: Studi tentang PKL di Bandung. *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Kebijakan Publik*, 15(1), 120-134.

Book:

- Arora, S., & Gupta, P. (2020). *Public policy: Making and implementation*. Sage Publications.
- Bogdan, R., & Biklen, S. K. (2007). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods (5th ed.)*. Pearson Education.

- Brock, M. (2017). *Urban policy and street vendors in the global city: Understanding the dynamics of informal commerce*. Routledge.
- Charmaz, K. (2014). *Constructing Grounded Theory (2nd ed.)*. Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W. (2018). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches (4th ed.)*. Sage Publications.
- Dye, T. R. (2017). *Understanding public policy (15th ed.)*. Pearson Education.
- Gaus, J. W. (2014). *Urban policy and the public interest: Understanding the relationship between planning and governance*. The University of Chicago Press.
- Grindle, M. S. (2016). *Politics and policy implementation in the third world*. Princeton University Press.
- Hill, M., & Hupe, P. (2017). *Implementing public policy (2nd ed.)*. Sage Publications.
- Hill, M., & Varone, F. (2015). *The public policy process (6th ed.)*. Pearson Education.
- Lipsky, M. (2010). *Street-level bureaucracy: Dilemmas of the individual in public services (30th anniversary ed.)*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- McConnell, A. (2018). *Public policy: A critical approach (2nd ed.)*. Sage Publications.
- Moleong, L. J. (2017). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif (Edisi Revisi)*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Putri, A. S., & Santoso, P. (2022). *Perencanaan Tata Ruang Kota: Konflik dan Solusi*. Penerbit Universitas Indonesia.
- Sabatier, P. A., & Mazmanian, D. A. (2019). *Theories of the policy process (4th ed.)*. Westview Press.
- Suryana, Y. (2016). *Pengelolaan dan penataan pedagang kaki lima di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia Press.
- Sutrisno, A. (2014). *Penataan ruang kota dan keberlanjutan pembangunan*. Pustaka Pelajar.
- Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods (5th ed.)*. Sage Publications.

Etc:

- Badan Meteorologi, Klimatologi, dan Geofisika. (2022). Laporan Iklim Tahunan Kota Bandung. BMKG.
- Badan Pusat Statistik. (2023). Kota Bandung dalam Angka 2023. Badan Pusat Statistik Kota Bandung.
- Bappeda Kota Bandung. (2021). Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah Kota Bandung 2011-2031. Bappeda.
- Dinas Lingkungan Hidup Kota Bandung. (2022). Laporan Kebersihan Kota Bandung 2022. DLH.
- Dinas Pekerjaan Umum Kota Bandung. (2020). Laporan Tata Ruang Kota Bandung. DPU Bandung.
- Dinas Perdagangan dan Perindustrian Kota Bandung. (2022). Laporan Evaluasi Penataan PKL Kota Bandung.
- Diskominfo Jabar. (2024). Laporan Penataan PKL di Kota Bandung. Dinas Komunikasi dan Informatika Jawa Barat.
- Kementerian Pekerjaan Umum dan Perumahan Rakyat. (2022). Revitalisasi Kota Ramah Wisata.
- Pemerintah Kota Bandung. (2011). Peraturan Daerah Kota Bandung Nomor 4 Tahun 2011 tentang Penataan dan Pemberdayaan Pedagang Kaki Lima.
- Pemerintah Kota Bandung. (2019). Peraturan Wali Kota Bandung Nomor 32 Tahun 2019 tentang Penataan dan Pembinaan Pedagang Kaki Lima.
- Pemerintah Kota Bandung. (2021). Strategi Penataan PKL di Kota Bandung.
- Peraturan Wali Kota Bandung Nomor 571 Tahun 2014 tentang Penataan PKL.
- Peraturan Wali Kota Bandung Nomor 888 Tahun 2012 tentang Petunjuk Pelaksanaan Peraturan Daerah Kota Bandung Nomor 4 Tahun 2011.
- Supartoyo, R., et al. (2021). Sesar Lembang dan Risiko Gempa di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Geologi Indonesia*, 18(1), 30-45.